

Systematic Literature Review: The Implementation of Equalization from Administrative Positions to Functional Positions

Baidillah Sangkut, Dheo Rimbano & Yohanes Susanto

Bina Insan University, Lubuklinggau, Indonesia

Email: neknang@gmail.com

Abstract

This study aims to answer how the equalization from administrative to functional positions occurs. The method used is the Systematic Literature Review (SLR) approach to journals that were published from 2020 to 2023, based on the required topic and locus. Systematic Literature Reviews are a literature review method that identifies, assesses, and interprets all findings on research topics to answer research questions. This study concludes that equalization has been implemented in reference to Permepan RB Number 17 of 2021 regarding the equalization of administrative positions into functional positions. In practice, the equalization of administrative positions into functional positions still prioritizes qualifications and competencies, and it was carried out prior to changes in the organizational structure. This has become a new problem for the post-equalization government agencies to address. On the other hand, the transfer from an administrative position to a functional position creates distinct anxiety for the apparatus regarding their career development in the future.

Keywords: transfer of positions, administrative position, functional position, human resource management.

1. Introduction

Position equalization is a form of bureaucratic simplification that is the focus of the priority program of the Advanced Indonesia Cabinet under the leadership of President Ir. Joko Widodo and Ma'ruf Amin. The aim of this program is to improve the quality of public services and the performance of public organizations, which are still considered too bureaucratic and have long spans of command. Regulation-wise, the implementation of position equalization is mandated by Government Regulation Number 17 of 2020 (President of the Republic of Indonesia, 2020) as an amendment to Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Servant Management. This amendment was issued as an implementing regulation of the Law in the context of bureaucratic structuring (Article 350A).

At the technical level, it is stipulated through the PAN RB RI Ministerial Regulation Number 28 of 2019 concerning the Equalization of Administrative Positions into Functional Positions. Finally, this regulation has been amended through the Republic of Indonesia PAN RB Ministerial Regulation Number 17 of 2021 (Ministry of PAN & RB, 2021).

(Rakhmawanto, 2021) disclosed the results of the analysis, showing that the simplification of the bureaucracy has not been effectively implemented. In this case, the implementation of equalizing administrative positions with functional positions still prioritizes qualification and competency aspects. However, the majority of administrative

officials who are transferred to functional positions do not meet the educational and competency requirements needed for those positions.

The policy of equalizing positions is an instrument taken by the government that is used in the context of developing the career apparatus, but in practice, it was disclosed (Marthalina, 2021) in her research entitled "Analysis of the Impact of Career Development for Civil Servants After the Implementation of the Transfer of Structural Positions to Functional Positions" at the Ministry of PAN RB RI stated that the implementation of the equalization of structural positions into functional positions has not had an impact on the career development of apparatus at the Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia. This is due to several challenges of change that still need to be adjusted by the existing apparatus and organizations. Another thing that is considered for career development in functional positions is the organizational design that is expected to be proportional which can accommodate the working mechanism of functional positions.

The policy of equalizing positions is an instrument taken by the government that is used in the context of career development. Several other studies (Panca Timur, Widya et al., 2022; Rusliandy, 2022; Tuasamu et al., 2022) generally reveal problems in implementing simplification of the bureaucracy faced with several things, namely: the organizational design has not been designed to accommodate the performance of functional positions, the management of functional positions has not been professional in some supervisory agencies, the types of functional positions that are not yet available, competency gaps, and patterns of work relationships that have not been maximized. Individual performance assessments have not been aligned with organizational performance.

In line with the above, according to Daud and Rosadi (Nisa et al., 2022), one of the effects of transferring administrative officials to functional positions that are more competency-based or expertise is that it is not certain that the employees with the qualifications for the functional positions are precise. According to Insani et al. (2021) in his research, he recommends that arrangements for the transfer of administrative positions to functional positions need to be improved by taking into account organizational factors, resources, the development and management of awards, and employee relations..

The various problems above confirm that the policy of equalizing positions has not been implemented effectively and still leaves homework to be completed. From the apparatus side, for example, aspects of career development, work mechanisms, and management of functional positions must be the main priority that must be prepared after the equalization of positions. This is not without reason, bearing in mind that the apparatus that is the object of implementing this policy is the driving force, which determines the sustainability of the organization.

2. Literature Review

Equalization of positions is a form of Bureaucratic Simplification, which is the priority program focus of the Advanced Indonesia Cabinet. The aim is to improve the quality of public services and the performance of public organizations that are still considered too bureaucratic and have long spans of command. The implementation of the equalization of positions is mandated by Government Regulation Number 17 of 2020, as a change from Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 Concerning Civil Servants

Management.

At the technical level, it is stipulated through the Republic of Indonesia PAN RB Ministerial Regulation Number 28 of 2019 Concerning the Equalization of Administrative Positions into Functional Positions, as amended through the Republic of Indonesia PAN RB Ministerial Regulation Number 17 of 2021.

According to the general provisions of the Republic of Indonesia PAN RB Ministerial Regulation Number 17 of 2021, it is stated: The equalization of positions is the appointment of administrative officials to functional positions through adjustments/inpassing in equivalent functional positions. Therefore, it can be concluded that the equalization of positions involves transferring structural administrative officials to functional positions. As explained by Fitrianingrum et al. (2020), Panca Timur Widya et al. (2022), and Setiawan et al. (2022), the equalization of positions refers to the transfer of administrative positions to functional positions.

Referring to the provisions in the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 17 of 2021 and the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 25 of 2021, the stages of simplifying the bureaucracy are carried out in three stages, namely: (1) Simplification of the organizational structure; (2) Equalization of positions; and (3) Adjustment of the work system. This was also stated by Nisa et al. in their research entitled "Analysis of the Implementation of Bureaucratic Simplification Policies in the Sphere of the Provincial Government of South Kalimantan" in 2022.

3. Research Method

This study uses a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) approach with data sources derived from electronic journal literature that has been published via the internet. Data collection was carried out by searching the internet using Google Scholar. The research data population includes journals that focus on simplifying bureaucracy and equalizing positions in local governments, as well as several relevant journals that are only used as library materials. As opinion (Triandini et al., 2019) a Systematic Literature Review is a method used to refer to certain research or research methodologies and developments carried out to collect and evaluate related research on a particular topic of focus. Another opinion, according to (Latifah & Ritonga, 2020) A systematic literature review is a research method that reviews a particular topic by emphasizing a single question that has been systematically identified, assessed, selected, and concluded according to predetermined criteria. This is done based on evidence from quality research that is relevant to the research question. *Search process* or The process of searching for the data needed in this study was carried out by surfing the internet using Google Scholar to find the journals required. This was done through the use of specific keywords such as "equalization of positions" and "simplification of the bureaucracy". The criteria set for this study were also taken into consideration during the search: the data used is in the range of 2020-2023, data obtained from the source <https://scholar.google.co.id/>, the data used is only journals that have been published, in accordance with the topic of equalization of positions and simplification of the bureaucracy, the research locus is only on local government, the discussion can answer the research question. Research questions in this study were made based on the needs of the research topic regarding the

implementation of equalization of positions, which focus on five elements known as PICOC, namely: (1) Population, the target group for investigation; (2) Intervention (I), determining aspects of the investigation or problems of interest to researchers; (3) Comparison (C), aspects of the investigation that will be compared with interventions; (4) Outcomes (O), the effect of the intervention; and (5) Context (C), setting or investigative environment (Wahono, 2016).

4. Findings and Discussions

A literature search was conducted in June 2023. The initial search process was carried out based on the year of publication in the 2020-2023 range, using the keywords "equalization of positions" and "bureaucratic simplification". The search results found 174 articles, which were then selected. The literature used consists solely of journal papers that meet the set criteria. The selection process is also carried out by examining the title, abstract, locus, and full text, so that the results of the main study are obtained, which will be used for further analysis.

Table 1. Search Filtering

No	Criteria	Amount
1	Invalid (non-journal article)	108
2	In accordance with the topic of equalization of positions	66
3	The locus does not meet the criteria	42
4	The discussion cannot answer the research question	17
5	Selected articles	7

From the table above, it can be seen that out of the 174 search results, there were 108 invalid articles, namely not journals but theses or dissertations, and the discussions were not in accordance with the topic of equality. There were 66 articles that fit the topic of equalization of positions, but 42 articles did not match the desired focus, and 17 articles had discussions unrelated to the research question. 7 articles were selected as the main articles.

Table 2. Main article

Article	Researcher/ Title	Result
1	Wilga Lazul Nuviandra, Munari Kustanto Implementation Of Equivalent Officials On Career Patterns Of Functional Officials Results Results In The Government Of	The implementation of equalization of positions still needs to be improved too. There needs to be more consistency in the regulations governing the equalization policy, so simplifying the competencies and age limits of officials resulting from the equalization can hinder their career patterns. Available positions were found due to the equalization that was not following their educational

	Sidoarjo District	background and competence. As many as 30% of functional officers who have been equalized are over 53 years old, so it has the potential to affect their performance in functional positions
2	Dicky Hariya Pratama, Gatot DH Wibowo, Chrisdianto Eko Purnomo / Implementation of Equalization of Administrative Positions into Functional Positions in Local Government (Studies in the Regional Government of NTB Province)	The Implementation of Regulations on the Equalization of Administrative Positions Into Functional Positions in the Regional Government of the Province of NTB is not effective, this is due to communication factors, resources, dispositions and bureaucratic structures which are still in an adaptive process and are not optimal in supporting organizational equalization policies in the Regional Government of the Province of NTB
3	Zendy N. Mailensun Implementation of the Policy for Equal Positions in the Structural Secretariat of the Minahasa Regency Regional Secretariat	there are four factors that influence the implementation of equalization of positions at the Regional Secretariat of Minahasa Regency, namely communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. Unclear communication and no tiered top-down or bottom-up causes confusion for civil servants whose positions are equalized regarding their career development. Resources of funds, equipment and infrastructure are also not optimal. The disposition of PNS whose positions are equalized is quite high, but the lack of knowledge and socialization causes confusion about the terms of office that must be fulfilled.
4	Latifa Suhada Nisa, Sri Setyati, Maliani, Dewi Siska, Siska Fitriyanti Analysis Of Implementation Of Bureaucracy Simple Policy In The Government Of South Kalimantan Province	The problem faced by the South Kalimantan Provincial Government after the implementation of equalization is that the work system needs to be adjusted. In addition, implementing a policy that is still partial creates jealousy, inequality and work demotivation. This also impacts the irrelevance of the job made and approved by the Ministry of Home Affairs to be implemented at the next inauguration due to mutations, promotions, and retiring employees.
5	Hadi Tuasamu, Hartaty Hadady, Johan Fahri / Intervention Of Equal Position: Analysis Of The Effectiveness Of Equivalent Administrative To Functional Positions In The Regional Secretariat Of North Maluku Province	The results of the study analysis show that the policy of equalizing administrative positions to functional positions has not been implemented effectively. The impact on the equalization of administrative positions into functional positions is still in accordance with the indicators of organizational efficiency. Administrative officers who are transferred to majority functional positions do not meet the educational and competency requirements required in the functional positions they will occupy, because the equalization of positions provides a lot of tolerance for the requirements of functional positions.
6	Hani Marta Theodora, Pery Rehendra Sucipta, Irman / Legal	The implementation of Permen PAN RB No. 17 in 2021 raises legal issues that need serious attention, not only by

	Implications of Equalization Administrative Position Become The Functional Position In The Government Of Riau Islands	the Regional Government but also by the Central Government. Because there is a regulation that the equalization of employment positions of state agencies is carried out after completing the process of organizational simplification, but the legal regulations governing the simplification of the organizational apparatus exist.
7	Made Anik Widyastuti, Putu Indah Rahmawati, Ni Made Ary Widiastini / The Influence of Civil Servants' Perceptions on Position Transfer Policies on Work Objectives in the Buleleng Regency Government	This transfer of position will change the organizational structure and affect the career, mindset and job satisfaction of Civil Servants (PNS) but the implementation of this transfer is still not optimal because there are still obstacles faced, such as the process and procedures for assessing credit scores for promotions that do not exist. clarity. Based on the results of quantitative analysis with descriptive statistics that the perception of civil servants is higher in structural positions than in functional positions because civil servants feel a high level of job satisfaction while still occupying structural positions compared to after being transferred to functional positions. There is a significant difference in the job satisfaction of civil servants before the transfer of positions (structural) and job satisfaction of civil servants after the transfer of positions (functional). Job satisfaction in structural positions is greater than after being transferred to functional positions with dominant indicators shown by promotion, competence and income/salary.

Table 3. Method, Theory and Problems

Artikel	Method (RQ1)	Theory (RQ2)	Problems (RQ3)
1	Qualitatif	George Edward III (Communication, Resource, organisation structure, dispositions)	The lack of optimal communication dimension again has an impact on other dimensions. Inconsistency which ultimately results in confusion in the process of equalizing positions makes the dimensions of implementation attitudes also not optimal.
2	Legal Empirics	George Edward III (Communication, Resource, organisation structure, dispositions)	Communication factors, resources, dispositions and bureaucratic structures are still in the process of being adaptive and not optimal in supporting equalization policies.
3	Qualitatif	George Edward III	Unclear communication and no tiered top-down or bottom-up causes confusion for PNS whose positions

		(Communication, Resource, organisation structure, dispositions)	are equal regarding their career development. Funding, equipment and infrastructure resources are also not optimal. The disposition of civil servants whose positions are equalized is quite high, but the lack of knowledge and socialization causes confusion about the job requirements that must be met.
4	Qualitatif	Process of Policy Implementation	Problems arising from the implementation of the equalization policy, including related to the implementation of the policy which is still partial, causing jealousy, gaps and work motivation for equalization JF, besides that JF's knowledge of equalization of his new position is still very minimal.
5	Qualitatif (Descriptof)	Robbins : Organizational Effectiveness	Management of functional positions that are not yet professional. Types of functional positions that are not yet available in several Agencies/ Agencies. Selection for transfer to functional positions is not yet stringent, resulting in a gap in competency. Patterns of interaction or work relationship arrangements that have not maximized functional positions. The transformation of performance management is still characterized by individual performance assessments that are not yet in line with organizational performance. Lack of performance management
6	normative legal research	Nur Hasan Ismail : Legal Certainty	This reluctance in setting this policy can be attributed to a number of factors as Rusliandy (2022) stated in his research, namely the absence of an organizational design suitable for the performance of the positions. capacity, the types of positions that regional organizations need are not readily available. leads to a mismatch between the performance of functional officials and the performance of the organization.
7	Mixed (qualitative descriptive and quantitative)	Policy Implementation (not Specific) Civil Servants' Perceptions Job Satisfaction	Concerns and problems with the transfer of structural to functional positions are related to the process of promotion of functional officials because until now there has been no information regarding the team of supervisors/assessors of credit scores, technical instructions and the assessment process. In addition, there are still many civil servants who are still confused about their functional positions due to lack of understanding in the management of functional positions in the personnel department

From the table above, based on the 7 (seven) selected main articles, a review was carried out to obtain answers to the research questions that had been developed.

Research Method (RQ1). To answer research questions about the method used there were

4 (four) researchers (Mailensun, 2022; Nisa et al., 2022; Nuviantra & Kustanto, 2023; Tuasamu et al., 2022) using a descriptive qualitative approach, 2 (two) researchers (Pratama et al., 2023; Theodora, 2023) use normative law research and 1 (one) researcher (Widyastuti et al., 2022) using a combined approach of qualitative and quantitative. Almost all researchers use a descriptive qualitative approach, either by means of library research, observation or in-depth interviews. This is considered appropriate to describe the implementation of the equalization of positions that have been carried out.

Theory (RQ2). In analyzing the implementation of the policy of equalizing administrative positions into functional positions, the theories used by researchers are very diverse, but the theory is the most widely used (Mailensun, 2022; Nuviantra & Kustanto, 2023; Pratama et al., 2023) is the theory of public policy implementation by George C. Edward III. This is done by analyzing four dimensions, namely communication, resources, bureaucratic structure, and attitude of implementers (dispositions). (Nuviantra & Kustanto, 2023). Researcher (Theodora, 2023) conduct an analysis using the theory of legal certainty from Nur Hasan, while researchers (Nisa et al., 2022) using the theory of policy processes and researchers (Tuasamu et al., 2022) menggunakan analisis Organizational effectiveness dari Robbins. And, (Widyastuti et al., 2022) who uses a mixed method in his research using Policy Implementation theory for qualitative research and Civil Servants Perception and Job Satisfaction for quantitative research.

Problems (RQ3). If using George C. Edward III's theory of public policy implementation, the problems encountered in the implementation of the equalization of administrative positions into functional positions are generally due to the not yet optimal communication dimension in implementing policies. The inconsistency of the communication factor causes other factors to be disrupted, thus hindering the implementation of equalization of positions. If seen from the theory of policy processes conducted by researchers (Nisa et al., 2022) the problem encountered is the implementation of policies that are still partial, causing jealousy, gaps and work motivation for equalizing JF, in addition to that JF's knowledge of equalization of his new position is also still very minimal. When viewed from the theory of legal certainty, the problem that appears is that there is no organizational design that is in accordance with the performance of the position, capacity, the type of position needed by regional organizations is not available which ultimately causes a mismatch between the performance of functional officials and organizational performance. When viewed from Organization effectiveness (Robbins) theory, the problems encountered are functional position management that is not yet professional, types of positions are not yet available, competency gaps, patterns of interaction or working relationships that have not accommodated functional positions, individual performance assessments are not aligned with organizational and management performance still weak performance. And, when viewed from quantitative research through employee perceptions and job satisfaction, a number of problems were found. Concerns and problems with the transfer of structural to functional positions are related to the process of promotion to functional officials because until now there has been no information regarding the credit score monitoring/assessment team, technical instructions and the assessment process. In addition, there are still many civil servants who are still confused about their functional positions due to a lack of understanding in the management of functional positions in the staffing department.

5. Conclusion

The results of the Systematic Literature Review (SLR) of all research contained in journals that have been published from 2020 to 2023 state that the implementation of the policy of equalizing administrative and functional positions is still not effective and optimal. This can be seen from the many problems found during and after the implementation of the policy. Some of the causes of the ineffective implementation of this policy are the dimensions of communication, the very short implementation time, the lack of supporting regulations, and the inconsistency of laws and regulations, which create ambiguity in policy implementation. Additionally, the readiness of the functional position supervisory agencies and the readiness of the apparatus themselves to occupy functional positions that have not been well organized also contribute to the implementation challenges of the equalization of positions policy, which essentially involves the abolition of the obligations of the central government to regional governments.

References

- Fitrianingrum, L., Lusyana, D., & Lellyana, D. (2020). Pengembangan Karier Jabatan Fungsional Dari Hasil Penyetaraan Jabatan Administrasi: Analisis Implementasi dan Tantangan. *Civil Service*, 14(1), 43–54.
- Insani, I., Warsono, H., Kismartini, & Astuti, R. S. (2021). Analysis of the Transfer of Administrative Positions to Functional Positions at the Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform. *Proceedings of the 3rd Annual International Conference on Public and Business Administration (AICoBPA 2020)*, 191(AICoBPA 2020), 333–337. <https://doi.org/10.2991/aebmr.k.210928.063>
- Kementerian PAN & RB. (2021). Peraturan Menteri Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara dan Reformasi Birokrasi Republik Indonesia Nomor 17 Tahun 2021 Tentang Penyetaraan Jabatan Administrasi Ke Dalam Jabatan Fungsional. *Menteri Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara Dan Reformasi Birokrasi Republik Indonesia*, 1–31.
- Latifah, L., & Ritonga, I. (2020). Systematic Literature Review (SLR): Kompetensi Sumber Daya Insani Bagi Perkembangan Perbankan Syariah Di Indonesia. *Al Maal: Journal of Islamic Economics and Banking*, 2(1), 63. <https://doi.org/10.31000/almaal.v2i1.2763>
- Mailensun, Z. N. (2022). *Civilia: Implementasi Kebijakan Penyetaraan Jabatan Struktural Sekretariat Daerah Kabupaten Minahasa Zandy N. Mailensun Pascasarjana Universitas Negeri Manado Civilia: A*. PENDAHULUAN Peraturan Menteri Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara dan Reformasi Birokr. 1(November).
- Marthalina, M. (2021). Analisis Dampak Pengembangan Karir PNS Pasca Pelaksanaan Alih Jabatan Struktural ke Jabatan Fungsional. *Jurnal MSDA (Manajemen Sumber Daya Aparatur)*, 9(1), 42–55. <https://doi.org/10.33701/jmsda.v9i1.1716>
- Nisa, L. S., Sri Setyati, Maliani, Dewi Siska, & Siska Fitriyanti. (2022). Analisis Pelaksanaan Kebijakan Penyederhanaan Birokrasi Di Lingkup Pemerintah Provinsi Kalimantan Selatan. *Jurnal Kebijakan Pembangunan*, 17(2), 167–184. <https://doi.org/10.47441/jkp.v17i2.284>

- Nuviandra, W. L., & Kustanto, M. (2023). *IMPLEMENTASI PENYETARAAN JABATAN TERHADAP POLA KARIER PEJABAT FUNGSIONAL HASIL PENYETARAAN DI PEMERINTAH KABUPATEN SIDOARJO*. 7(1), 347–350. <https://doi.org/10.32630/sukowati.v7i1.350>
- Panca Timur Widya, Fauzi Amin, Yakub, & Satyawati Tara. (2022). Implementasi Penyetaraan Jabatan Administrasi Tenaga Kependidikan Ke Jabatan Fungsional Di Universitas Negeri Surabaya. *Jurnal Dinamika Manajemen Pendidikan*, 07, 39–47.
- Pratama, D. H., Wibowo, G. D. H., & Purnomo, C. E. (2023). *Implementasi Penyetaraan Jabatan Administrasi ke Dalam Jabatan Fungsional pada Pemerintah Daerah (Studi di Pemerintah Daerah Provinsi NTB)*.
- Presiden RI. (2020). Peraturan Pemerintah 17/2020 tentang Perubahan PP 11/2019 Manajemen Pegawai Negeri Sipil. *Lembar Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 2020 Nomor 68, 023819*, 33.
- Rakhmawanto, A. (2021). Analisis Dampak Perampangan Birokrasi Terhadap Penyetaraan Jabatan Administrator Dan Pengawas. *Civil Service*, 15, No.2, 11–24.
- Rusliandy. (2022). Analisis Kebijakan Penyederhanaan Birokrasi Pemerintah Daerah. *Kolaborasi : Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 8(1), 54–68.
- Setiawan, I., Sururama, R., & Nurdin, I. (2022). Implementasi Kebijakan Penyederhanaan Organisasi Di Kementerian Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara dan Reformasi Birokrasi. *Jurnal Terapan Pemerintahan Minangkabau*, 2(1), 12–25. <https://doi.org/10.33701/jtpm.v2i1.2380>
- Theodora, H. M. (2023). *Legal Implications of Equalization Administrative Position Become The Functional Position In The Government Of Riau Islands*. 415(1499), 140–148.
- Triandini, E., Jayanatha, S., Indrawan, A., Werla Putra, G., & Iswara, B. (2019). Metode Systematic Literature Review untuk Identifikasi Platform dan Metode Pengembangan Sistem Informasi di Indonesia. *Indonesian Journal of Information Systems*, 1(2), 63. <https://doi.org/10.24002/ijis.v1i2.1916>
- Tuasamu, H., Hadady, H., Fahri, J., & Khairun, U. (2022). *Jabatan Administrasi Ke Jabatan Fungsional Pada Sekretariat*. 22(2), 70–76.
- Widyastuti, M. A., Rahmawati, P. I., & ... (2022). The Influence of Civil Servants' Perceptions on Position Transfer Policies on Work Objectives in the Buleleng Regency Government. ... *Research and Critics* ..., 2, 23859–23869. <https://bircu-journal.com/index.php/birci/article/view/6405>

Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>)



*International Conference on Business, Economics & Management
for Sustainable Future*

e-ISSN: 3021-7784

July 18th, 2023

Published by:



Co-Host:

